

Ethical Frameworks

What is an Ethical Framework?

- Decision-making guide
 - Ethical commitments
 - Principles
 - Goals
 - Strategies
- Context-specific

Ethical Commitments

- Pursue common good
 - Be accountable, transparent, trustworthy
 - Promote solidarity, mutual responsibility
 - Respond fairly, effectively, efficiently

Principles

- Protect the population's health
- Protect public safety and civil order
- Treat people fairly, recognizing the moral equality of all

Goals

- Protect the population's health
 - ***Reduce mortality and serious morbidity***
- Protect public safety and civil order
- Treat people fairly, recognizing the moral equality of all

Goals

- Protect the population's health
- Protect public safety and civil order
 - ***Reduce disruption to critical infrastructures***
 - ***Promote public understanding and confidence***
- Treat people fairly, recognizing the moral equality of all

Goals

- Protect the population's health
- Protect public safety and civil order
- Treat people fairly, recognizing the moral equality of all
 - ***4 substantive***
 - ***1 procedural***

Fairness

- Reduce significant differences in mortality/morbidity
- Remove barriers to fair access
- Reciprocity
- Reduce significant differences in opportunities for normal lifespan
- Fair process

Strategies: General

- Do not ration based on:
 - Social value (gender, socio-economic class, race, citizenship, etc.)
 - Quality of life
 - Duration of extended life
 - First-come, first-served
- Do not resort to random process prematurely

Strategies: Rationing Criteria

- High risk of flu-related mortality and morbidity
- Good or acceptable response to resource
- Key workers for essential functions
- High risk of exposure to flu
- Risk of transmitting flu
- Lack of satisfactory alternatives
- Age?

Two Prioritization Tracks

- Key workers and general population prioritized differently, not equally
- Key workers prioritized for preventive resources and treatment antivirals
- Prioritized simultaneously except:
 - Outbreak antivirals (key workers only)
 - Masks (gen'l population only except as last resort for workers)
 - Ventilators (gen'l population only)

Key Workers

- Definition is disaster-specific
- Propose including more categories than NIAC or HS
- Critical to limiting flu-related deaths and infrastructure degradation
- ~5% of Minnesota's population

Rationing Criteria: Key Workers and General Population

- **Both:**

- High risk of flu-related mortality with good response
- High risk of exposure

- **Key workers only:**

- Irreplaceable
- At-risk in service to others

- **General population only:**

- Socially vulnerable groups
- Younger groups?

Strategies: Other Considerations

- Revise in light of new information
- Consider and adjust as part of comprehensive pandemic response plan
- Be informed by federal guidance, but not limited
- Scale to scarcity
- No group systematically de-prioritized

General Recommendations

- Conserve resources
- Collect, manage, analyze and report data
- Communicate and train
- Access barriers
- Standards of care
- Legal and regulatory protections
- Human resources policies
- Palliative and hospice services